



**CONFIDENTIAL**

December 16, 2013

**VIA E-MAIL DELIVERY**

Clare Francis

[Clare.francis1946@gmail.com](mailto:Clare.francis1946@gmail.com)

Caroline Whitacre, PhD  
Vice President for Research  
Professor of Microbial  
Infection and Immunity  
614-247-8356 Phone

**Reference: Additional Allegations of Research Misconduct**

Dear Ms. Francis:

The Ohio State University received your additional allegations against university faculty member Carlo M. Croce Ph.D., which were detailed in the emails you sent on December 12, 2013 and December 14, 2013. As noted in my letter to you dated December 12, 2013, the University reviewed the manuscripts numbered 1, 3, and 4 in your email of December 12, 2013 and determined that the manuscripts were not generated at Ohio State. Specifically, the corresponding authors for the manuscripts are not employed by the Ohio State University. Further, although Dr. Croce is a co-author on the three manuscripts, neither Dr. Croce nor any other Ohio State employee generated or provided any data for the figures in question, nor were they involved in the generation of the figures. In view of these facts, any questions regarding the figures in these papers would need to be addressed by the corresponding authors and their home institutions. Pertaining to manuscript 2 in your email of December 12, 2013, that manuscript was part of the original set of allegations (initially numbered 32) originally sent by you to the Office of Research Integrity (ORI) and then forwarded by you to Ohio State University on November 17, 2013. The manuscript was reviewed by the ORI and per the ORI there is no further action needed. As such, the Ohio State University considers this matter closed.

Please note that the Institution considers continued activities in this vein as constituting frivolous allegations and a waste of University and State resources.

Sincerely,

Caroline C. Whitacre, Ph.D.  
Vice President for Research

cc: Office of Research Compliance  
Office of Legal Affairs  
Office of Research Integrity (ORI)